Tools and Strategies for Managing Access

For
Foothills Research Institute
Annual General Meeting, June 17, 2009

Richard Williams
Eos Research & Consulting Ltd.
Origins

- Foothills Landscape Management Forum Workshop in May 2008
- Supported by Energy Partners to the Foothills Research Institute plus two others:
  - Canadian Natural Resources Ltd.
  - ConocoPhillips
  - Encana
  - Petro-Canada
  - Shell Canada
  - Talisman
  - TransCanada
Project Approach

• Focus on management of public lands;
• Approach included:
  – Literature review;
  – Interviews and survey of public land managers, users and interested parties.
• Three jurisdictions:
  – Alberta;
  – British Columbia;
  – US federal lands.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>• High level of oil &amp; gas activity in Foothills/northern Alta.;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Growing numbers of recreational users;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on continued road development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>• Mountain pine beetle infestation and oil &amp; gas;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Creating commercial recreational opportunities;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on continued road development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Federal Lands</td>
<td>• Tidal wave of recreational users;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• More roads and trails than can be maintained;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• In the Pacific NW, hydrological integrity a significant concern;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on reducing road inventory;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Growing oil and gas development in Rocky Mountain states</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Four Questions

• How is access management done?
• How is it adopted?
• What regulatory and non-regulatory tools are employed
• How effective are they?
How is Access Management Done?
This is Not Access Management!
Neither is This!
Successful access management needs an integrated strategy

- ..... six-point mantra to help prevent illegal vehicle trespass:

  • Outreach and education
  • Accurate maps
  • Boundary signage
  • Soft barriers
  • Hard barriers and
  • Law enforcement

Source: BLM
Access Management

Goals & Objectives

Monitoring

Planning

Communication

Enforcement

Implementation

- Footprint Reduction
- Physical Measures
- Design for Wildlife
- Decommissioning
- OHV Alternatives
How is Access Management Adopted?
# Access Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Tenure Planning</td>
<td>• Muskwa-Kechika Management Area, B.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Roan Plateau, Colorado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coordinated Operational Planning</td>
<td>• Kakwa-Copton Industrial Access Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Al-Pac Surmont Management Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Canfor Grande Prairie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• FLMF Integrated Industry Access Plan (Berland-Smoky)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Development Planning</td>
<td>• BC CAMP/Strategic Resource Management Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Castle IRP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• US federal Travel Management Planning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Planning

• Key Success Factors
  – Start with good information;
  – Secure adequate resources to complete the job;
  – Ensure good public engagement throughout.

• Practicing good public engagement!
  – Broad, multi-stakeholder representation;
  – Understand individual groups’ interests and needs;
  – Build trust and relationships among participants;
  – Clearly communicate the boundaries and objectives from the outset;
  – Engage a facilitator.
“..... indicators and targets must be measured and the results reported annually to Albertans .... paramount to maintaining and enhancing Albertans trust in Government ....”

- **Objectives, e.g.:**
  - Wildlife
  - Aesthetics
  - Hydrology/Geomorphology/Terrain Stability
  - User conflicts
  - Budget

- **Performance Measures, e.g.:**
  - Road length and density (”Secure habitat”)
  - Development footprints (area clearing, number of sites)
  - Livestock grazing
What Regulatory and Non-Regulatory Tools Are Employed?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Regulatory Basis for Managing Access</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Alberta             | • Public Lands Act  
|                     | • Forest Reserves Act  
|                     | • Forest Recreation Regulation  
|                     | • Draft Land-Use Framework?????      |
| British Columbia    | • Land Act  
|                     | • Forest & Range Practices Act  
|                     | • Wildlife Act  
|                     | • Motor Vehicle (All terrain) Act  
|                     | • Forest Planning & Practices Reg.  
|                     | • Land Use Objective Reg.  
|                     | • Forest Recreation Reg.            |
| US federal lands    | • Executive Orders 11644 & 11989  
|                     | • Agency specific regulations and guidance  
|                     | • 2001 Roadless Rule (Nat’l Forests) |
Implementation

Access Management Hierarchy

Need for New Access

Minimize Footprint
- Identify Alternatives to New Access

Coordinate Development
- Coordinate with other users to minimize access creation

Mitigate Effects of Access Creation

Control Use
- Education/Communication
- Physical Measures
- Enforcement

Design for Wildlife

Provide OHV Alternatives ("Parks")

Remove Unneeded Access
- Decommission (deactivate/restore/reclaim)
Develop a comprehensive communications strategy!

Communication:

• Key but often lacking.
• “Users respect closures if they understand why” .. ???
• Multiple channels and tools.
  – Long term/Strategic: education and ethics
  – Short term: what do you want users to do?
  – POU: specific directions.
Tread Lightly! is a nonprofit organization offering a variety of tools to help arm recreation industries that serve them with essential outdoor ethics. Our mission is to proactively promote recreation access and opportunities in the outdoors through education and stewardship.

Make a commitment to the outdoors; join our ranks! You can become a Friend of Tread Lightly! free today. OR, you can become a Member of Tread Lightly! for $25 and be automatically entered to win one of three outdoor gear packages, including free tires from Goodyear worth up to $800!

Quick Tips to Tread Lightly! Learn simple ways to minimize the impact of recreation and enjoy the outdoors with less environmental impact.

Tread Lightly! to Increase Its Outreach to Hunters, Fishermen, and Sport Shooters: In 2009, Tread Lightly! will be working hard to increase the awareness of its outdoor ethics messages among the hunting, fishing and sport shooting communities. Read more to find out how.
Segmenting users of public lands.
Enforcement

Spectrum of Enforcement Options

Public Visibility → Citizen Reporting → Public Patrols → Agency Patrols (Rovers) → Law Enforcement

But almost everyone spoken to reported too little enforcement and too small of penalties!
How Effective Are the Regulatory and Non-Regulatory Tools?
Monitoring

• Very little discussion of follow-up monitoring!
• Without monitoring objective assessment of effectiveness is difficult!

• Three examples of good (best) practice:
  – Greater Yellowstone Area Grizzly Bear Strategy
  – Foothills Landscape Management Forum
    (i.e. Berland-Smoky AMP)
  – Castle Access Management Plan

• Performance Measures, e.g.:
  – Road length and density (“Secure habitat”)
  – Development footprints (area cleared, number of sites)
## Regulatory Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Effectiveness</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Alberta             | • Least developed framework  
                      • Land-Use Framework will address in part????? | C     |
| British Columbia    | • Wide range of tools and requirements  
                      • Appear to be retreating from requirements to manage access  
                      • Resource Roads Act withdrawn | C-    |
| US federal lands    | • Well developed, comprehensive framework, but ...  
                      • Difficult implementation. | B     |
## Relative Effectiveness of Physical Access Controls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manned Gates</td>
<td>1*</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROW Re-Contouring</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rollback</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road Deactivation</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directional Drilling &amp; Boring</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmanned Gates</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removal of Stream Crossings</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excavations/Tank Traps</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berms</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Screening</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boulders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posts &amp; Rails</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: follow-up questions suggest that most respondents assumed gate-keepers have the ability to completely deny access.*
red herring
noun
1 a dried smoked herring, which is turned red by the smoke.
2 something, esp. a clue, that is or is intended to be misleading or distracting: the book is fast-paced, exciting, and full of red herrings. [ORIGIN: so named from the practice of using the scent of red herring in training hounds.]
Context is everything, e.g. effectiveness depends on public process, reasons for closure, location, associated measures, etc.

**In addition:**

- There is a publicly negotiated AMP and a FLUZ in place.
- Shell has successfully engaged both the Castle-Crown Wilderness Association and the Crowsnest Quad Squad.

Adjacent to well travelled public road.

Primary control

Credibility: Shell’s name not on signs.

Communicating purpose

Terrain should reinforce – but it does not here.

Reinforcing measure
• Communicating project results
  – Report
  – Project Summary
  – Etc.
• Pilot project
  – Secondary Road Plan for Berland-Smokey Access Management Area
• Guidelines?
Richard Williams
Eos Research & Consulting Ltd.
604/929-6157
richard-williams@shaw.ca